

How Far do the *Memorials* Versions of Marshall's Essays Correspond to their Original Texts?

John K. Whitaker

University of Virginia

Whitaker, John K., "How Far do the *Memorials* Versions of Marshall's Essays Correspond to their Original Texts?" *Marshall Studies Bulletin* 6 (1996): 25-43 <URL: <http://www.cce.unifi.it/rivista/whitak6.htm>>

Scholars familiar with Edgeworth's collection of his economic articles (1) will be aware that he amended the texts significantly for republication, often with inadequate warning. Thus anyone seeking the true historical record is advised to use the originals, despite the convenience of the collected versions. Similar suspicions have not arisen about the versions of Marshall's essays posthumously republished in *Memorials* under the editorship of A.C. Pigou, Marshall's student, colleague and professorial successor (2), and it seems fair to say that these versions have become the standard source for scholarly enquiries. Yet there are *prima facie* reasons for wondering how far the *Memorials* versions do coincide with the originals.

a) Pigou in editing the letters included in *Memorials* certainly made changes, some unindicated by elision marks, suggesting that he may have exercised similar editorial discretion over the essays (3).

b) More significantly, Marshall spent his last years working over his published essays with a view to republication, a task eventually entrusted to Pigou by Marshall's will. Marshall's handwritten modifications to his occasional publications – examples of which survive among his papers – were available to Pigou for his editorial work. As he explained in the "Editor's Preface" to *Memorials* "In some of the papers I have incorporated alterations that Marshall had made in the margin of his private copies".

He doubtless chose those alterations which seemed to him to give clearer or more judicious expression to Marshall's thought.

Such considerations led me to make a systematic comparison of the *Memorials* versions of Marshall's essays against their originals, omitting the three whose originals were inaccessible (4). I report only verbal changes and not the frequent alterations in punctuation, spelling, capitalisation, typographic layout, and so on, that were the inevitable consequence of reprinting in a standard "house style". Of the verbal changes, minor ones of no particular significance are briefly described (5) in the [Appendix](#). The text below reports only changes of greater potential interest, involving either a substantive change or a significant variation in diction. Additions to the *Memorials* versions that take the form of editorial footnotes or appendages, and are clearly identified as such, are not treated as changes calling for notice, however.

The pattern that emerges below is suggestive. In a few of the essays the changes are quite substantial. This is true especially of "The Graphic Method of Statistics", "A Fair Rate of Wages" and "The Equitable Distribution of Taxation". However in only one

essay, "Social Possibilities of Economic Chivalry", does Pigou indicate that "slight changes" had been made (p. 323n.) and these changes are indeed slight. Elsewhere, the existence of substantial changes is left to be inferred from the general statement, quoted above, that Pigou had inserted in his editorial preface. Given Marshall's inveterate tendency to revise and restate it seems unlikely that he would have altered some essays extensively and left others largely untouched. This leads me to conjecture that Pigou worked from Marshall's "private copies" in some cases, and these are the cases where substantial variations occur, whereas in other cases he worked from "clean" copies and in these cases, such as "Social Possibilities of Economic Chivalry", took responsibility for minor verbal changes and the occasional cleaning up of tangled sentences. This conjecture suggests that many of the changes recorded in the Appendix are Pigou's, whereas most of the changes recorded in the text below are Marshall's, but no definite imputation can be made.

I now list the substantial textual changes, dealing *seriatim* with the Memorials essays, omitting the three not covered (see footnote 4). The reader will find it helpful to have a copy of *Memorials* on hand to establish the context and the location of the original. For each change recorded, the *Memorials* reading is identified by page and line number and quoted or described. The variant reading found in the original is then given. Note that even in cases where no substantive alteration is recorded there may be minor alterations recorded in the [Appendix](#). The *Memorials* page range provided for each essay allows these to be identified.

Mr Jevons' Theory of Political Economy (pp. 93-99) [\(6\)](#)

Mr Mill's Theory of Value (pp. 119-133) [\(7\)](#)

Where to House the London Poor (pp. 142-151) [\(8\)](#)

151:11 "hardness is unmerited" replaces the original "hardness involves needless and bitter degradation and woe"

The Present Position of Economics (pp. 152-174) [\(9\)](#)

156:15-16 "The influence which they have exercised on economists in England and Germany has been, I think" replaces the original "The influence which they are now exercising on the younger economists in England and Germany is important, and, I think"

156:12-10u "Ricardo and his chief followers may be blamed" replaces "Much as Ricardo and his chief followers are to be blamed"

156:4u The original adds the sentence "This is the main point on which I wish to insist today."

157:19 "was so great as to make an epoch" replaces the original "was so great that he really opened out this new point of view, and by doing so he made an epoch", the allusion being to Adam Smith.

159:8 "It seems well to insist on this" replaces the original "It may seem trivial to insist on this, but it is not so"

159:18-19 "For that part of economic doctrine, which alone can claim universality, has no dogmas." replaces the original "For the theory, which is the only part of economic doctrine that has any claim to universality has no dogmas."

160:2 The original adds the sentence "But to this point I shall return."

161:1u "very difficult task" replaces the original "task that few can achieve. None can do it save those who have trained habits of scientific thought; and work with the aid of a special organon."

The Graphic Method of Statistics (pp. 175-187)(10)

175:4 "but its chief form is generally called" replaces the original "but to-day I shall speak only of its chief form, which is generally called"

175:12u "a chief function of the graphic method" replaces the original "Therefore I contend that the special function of the graphic method"

175:11u The original continues the sentence with "and that it ought to be organised with reference to this purpose."

176:17u "a diagram" replaces the original "Fossick's diagram"(11)

180:10 "Mathematics" replaces the original "Mathematics, the sister science of Statistics. I call them sister sciences because they both deal, directly at least, only with those causes and effects whose condition can be expressed in terms of quantity."

180:9u to 181:5 This passage in *Memorials* introduces confusion by omitting an equation while retaining the remark to which it applies. The original version of the passage reads as follows, portions in brackets representing footnotes:–

If, for instance, U be the quantity of the effect A in any year, then the increase of U during that year is its rate of growth at that time. [It is expressed as dU/dt .] So if X, Y, Z, \dots be the quantities at that time of B, C, D, \dots , the curves tell us their rate of growth. [That is $dX/dt, dY/dt, dZ/dt, \dots$] Now, A being a function of B, C, D, \dots , the rate of growth of A is made up of that part which is due to B , that part which is due to C , and so on. The part which is due to B is the product of the rate of growth of B into the dependence of A on B , [That is dU/dx .] and so for C, D , &c. The whole growth of A is then made up of the sum of these products. [That is

&c.

Sometimes it is best to separate that part of the growth of A which can be ascribed directly to the lapse of time, from that which is to be ascribed indirectly to time through its influence on B, C, D , &c. In that case we write

&c.

it being understood that the dU/dt on the right hand side of the equation is 'partial', and that on the left is 'total.']

181:12 "Thus, the system of historical curves claims to supply" replaces the original "What then I claim for the system of historical curves is that they supply"

181:18-17u This sentence is appended as a footnote in the original.

186:19 "The rule to determine this is: first find" replaces the original "The rule to determine this is substantially the same as before. We first find"

187:11 "We shall thus have got over the chief objection" replaces the original "We shall, I think, have got over one valid objection"

Remedies for Fluctuations in General Prices (pp. 188-211)

193:18 the original attaches the following footnote to the words "the other way":–

In the ratio of 3 to 2. For although a period of maximum production of gold has never exactly coincided with one of silver, the production of gold has been changing in the opposite direction to that of silver only during about 160 out of the last 400 years; during the remaining 240 the two productions have been either increasing together or diminishing together.

196:14-15 "to raise the value of gold, but to lower the value of silver" replaces the original's "not" by "but" as the sense seems to require.

203:1u The original adds in parentheses "See the adjoining diagram" placing the footnote index after the closing parenthesis. The diagram is inexplicably omitted from the *Memorials* version despite being referred to in 203n1. It is reproduced [here](#).

204:1 The subsection is erroneously numbered as IV rather than V in the original, while the one at 207:1 is erroneously numbered V

206:2-3 "obviate the sharp twinges that now frequently occur" replaces the original's "there" by "that" as the sense seems to require.

208n2:6-4u "I venture to regard this as due to his overlooking dangers connected with the geometric mean which, though less obvious, are more fatal in extreme cases than those of the arithmetic mean – the one flaw" replaces the original "I venture to regard this as a mathematical error, the one flaw", the allusion being to Jevons.

A Fair Rate of Wages (pp. 212-26)([12](#))

212:1-3 The opening sentence is not in the original.

212:6-7 "But in fact all socialist schemes" replaces the original "But these are not the questions we are asked to consider by Mr. Price. It is sufficient to say that all socialist schemes"

213:2 The original appends the following sentence: "This process seems to be going on with regard to the phrase 'a fair rate of wages', in spite of the hasty contempt that has been poured on it by some economists; and Mr. Price's essay will help the process forward."

213:4 The original indexes the following footnote after the quotation: "See an instructive lecture with this title published by Mr. Leonard Courtney, given at Plymouth in 1879, and published in the twenty-fifth volume of the 'Fortnightly Review'."

213:19 The original adds to this paragraph: "and it is so far justified by economic analysis that it may be accepted as the starting point of our present enquiry. Let us look at it a little more closely."

214:1 "is the 'normal' rate" replaces the original "is, in economic phrase, the 'normal' rate"

214:3-4 "at a particular place and time" replaces the original "here and now. It might be altered without any fundamental change in the rights of private property"

215:12 The original indexes the following footnote after the word "condition": "See pp. 61, 69, 73, and 96 of Mr. Price's essay."

218:22 The original appends the following sentence: "The facts and the arguments which are brought before us in the following pages give reasons for thinking that it may go very far."

218:15u The original indexes the following footnotes after the word "Conciliation": "See pp. 71 and 72, also pp. 37 &c."

218:15u The word "Delegates" replaces the original "This will always be associated with the name of Mr. Mundella, who has done more than anyone else to develop its strength and overcome its difficulties. In the ideal form of this plan, delegates"

218:11-9u "being careful not to make a demand which appears unreasonable when considered from that point of view" replaces the original "resolving to demand nothing that does not appear reasonable when looked at from that other side"

218:4u The original indexes the following footnote after the word "coal": "See pp. 38 and 76."

219:15u The original indexes the following footnote after the term "surface men": "See p. 73."

219:3u The original indexes the following footnote after the word "employers": "See pp. 81-87."

220:6 The original indexes the following footnote after the word "sold": "See pp. 59, 67, 74, and 89."

221:10 The original prefixes this paragraph with the additional sentence: "Studies such of those of Professor Munro and Mr. Price will help much towards a clear understanding of the principles on which sliding scales should be arranged."

221:12-13 "perhaps in 'royalties' to owners of land in which the mineral strata lie: so the price" replaces the original "and the price"

221:17 the original indexes the following footnote after the word "satisfactory": "See p. 95."

222:8 The original indexes the following footnote at the paragraph end:

Government already does work of the kind desired in regard to the tithe commutation tables. But instead of dealing with wheat, barley, and oats, it would deal with all important commodities. It would publish their prices once a month or once a year; it would reckon the importance of each commodity as proportioned to the total sum spent on it; and then by simple arithmetic deduce the change in the purchasing power of gold. Employers could arrange to pay as wages, instead of a fixed sum of (say) 30s., a sum of money so varying that it always gave the wage receiver the same purchasing power as 30s. did at the time of making the arrangement. Borrowings again could, at the option of the contracting parties, be reckoned in government units. On this plan, if A lends B 1,000l. at 4 1/2 per cent. interest, and after some years the purchasing power of money had risen by an eighth, he would have to pay interest, not 45l., but a sum that had the same purchasing power as 45l. had at the time of borrowing, *i.e.*, 40l., and so on. The plan would have to win its way into general use; but when it had once become familiar, none but gamblers would lend or borrow on any other terms, at all events for long periods. The scheme has no claims to theoretic perfection, but only to being a great improvement on our present methods attainable with little trouble. Even the rough results got by adding together (as the 'Economist' does) the rise or fall in the wholesale prices of each of several important commodities, and taking the average of them, would provide a standard many times more stable than can be given by gold or silver, or even a combination of the two. But we might at once go a good deal beyond this, and gradually, as the machinery of our statistical departments improved, we might get very near to our ultimate aim – which is to obtain a unit (for the United Kingdom) which will give a uniform power of satisfying his wants to the average consumer; that is to a person who consumes a 37,000,000th part of the total of every commodity consumed by the 37,000,000 inhabitants of the country. (See an article by the present writer in the *Contemporary Review* for March, 1887; also Jevons's *Money*, chap. xxv.)

222:12-11u "may indeed be reached at which further explanations only accentuate" replaces the original "must sometimes be arrived at when further explanations seem to be worse than waste of time, and do but accentuate"

222:9u The original indexes the following footnote after the word "arbitrator": "See p. 39."

222:4u The original indexes the following footnote after the word "rightly": "See pp. 49-53."

223:5-4u The original interpolates the following further paragraph between the *Memorials* paragraphs:

When a board of conciliation meets in angry temper, and it is certain from the beginning that the questions at issue must be fought out before an arbiter, the procedure, though technically different, is practically the same as in the plan which usually goes by the name of arbitration. It may be convenient sometimes to contrast sharply the two methods of conciliation and arbitration but Mr. Price seems to be right in treating them together, and regarding them as two forms of the same thing. Arbitration technically so called must begin with a more or less conciliatory meeting of delegates to agree on an arbiter, and draw out a case to be submitted to him; and the principles on which he has to act are generally the same as they would have been if the case were put before him by a board of conciliation in an angry mood.

224:6 The original indexes the following footnote after the word "decision": "See pp. 104 and 105."

224:13 to 225:11 These three paragraphs do not occur in the original which has instead the following passage, interpolations in brackets indicating footnotes:

In this connection it becomes very important to know how far the working classes are migratory in their habits. Mr. Ravenstein has recently found that they are much more migratory than is generally supposed; and the study of this question with which Mr. Price ends his essay [see pp. 104 and 105], is an important contribution to the data of economics.

It has been suggested that boards of conciliation may lead employers and employed to set themselves to exclude competition, even perhaps to resist improvements in production that would diminish their own employment, and in short to follow the example set them by many mediaeval guilds, of hardening themselves into organised conspiracies for promoting the well being of the privileged few at the expense of the great mass of the people. But thanks to the publicity of modern times, to the rapid migration of industries, and to the keenness of foreign competition in most trades, there is very little fear of this great evil. There is more danger that improvements in the organisation of some classes of workers may lead to the oppression of other classes who are joined with them in the same production, but are not organised [see pp. 106 &c.]; and thus in all economic questions considerations of the higher ethics will always assert themselves, however much we try to limit out inquiry for an immediate practical purpose.

225:12 "Conciliation and arbitration are, indeed, helpless" replaces the original "Conciliation is helpless"

225:21 The original inserts the following additional sentence after the word "beings":

The fundamental wrong is in allowing large classes of people to grow up with so poor an education, physical, mental, and moral, that they are unfit for intelligent and energetic work, and must crowd into and pull down the wages of the few kinds of work of which they are capable.

226:1-5 The paragraph's first two sentences replace the following sentence in the original: "Conciliation is thus a powerful means of raising the working classes: it is scarcely less powerful a means of raising their employers."

Some Aspects of Competition (pp. 256-291)

Benjamin Jowett (pp. 292-294)

The Old Generation of Economists and the New (pp. 295-311)

295n1: This footnote appears in the original without the second sentence.

298:7-5u "an increase in the skill with which the partial thoughts of economists of earlier times are interpreted" replaces the original "an increase in our skill in interpreting the partial thoughts of economists of earlier times, and distilling from them ideas fraught with instruction for ourselves"

300:18u "It has been shown" replaces the following passage in the original

We should be drawn too far into technical subtleties, if we were to examine minutely changes in the method of thought and expression which have been introduced into economics from contact with the various branches of physical science. But it may be said briefly that the latter half of the nineteenth century has thoroughly overhauled the doctrines of the earlier economists as to *tendencies*; and while pruning away much, has set the remainder in order and established them on a firm scientific basis. It has been shown

300:5u "Economists have in recent years come more nearly into" replaces the original "And, in the latter half of the century, economists have gone one step further and come more into"

301:4-6 "This study the shrewd ordinary man makes, though he may not know it; the man of science makes it and knows that he does so" replaces the original "This the shrewd ordinary man does, though he may not know it, any more than he knows that he is talking prose. The man of science does it, and knows that he does it"

303:5 "forces" replaces the original "forms" as the sense seems to require.

Mechanical and Biological Analogies in Economics (pp. 312-318) (13)

312:1 "Statics and Dynamics" replaces the original "Economic Statics and Dynamics (or Kinetics)"

312:8-6u "packed at the top of a railway carriage with reference to statical conditions only, are likely to fall" replaces the original "packed with reference to statical conditions only are likely to fall on his head"

318:1u Section II of the original is concluded by the addition of the following paragraph:

I will now try to show how this notion is pursued in the first Volume of my *Principles*; though fear that the attempt may prove wearisome to the reader. For discussions of method are tedious; every one's method should, as a rule, explain itself. But this requires the complete working out of the method: it cannot be done in a first Volume.

Henry Sidgwick (p. 319). (14)

An Export Duty on Coal (pp. 320-322)

Social Possibilities of Economic Chivalry (pp. 323-346) (15)

323 The original attaches the following footnote to the title: "This paper develops the notes prepared for a speech which was made at the dinner of the Royal Economic Society on 9th January, 1907, including some which were not used at the time."

338:7-9 "had nothing else to do:— even if none of their energies were demanded for private businesses of their own, or for conciliating" replaces the original "had no private businesses of their own to add to their burdens; and if they were not compelled to pay attention to appropriate means for conciliating"

The Equitable Burden of Taxation (pp. 347-357) (16)

347:16u "was long dormant: but now it is seen" replaces "remain dominant; but, when the war began the tide was in full swing towards the notion"

348:10u The original concludes the paragraph by adding the following further sentences:

Their life is an integral part of the national life. If all were equal in wealth and other matters, national life would be something more than the aggregate of the lives of its individual members, and all would need to make sacrifices for it. As things are, while all must suffer, and if needs be die, in time of war for the national life; the purses of the well-to-do alone can be expected to contribute largely to its expenses in time of peace. To do so is merely good business: it is not charity.

348:7u The original interpolates "—a matter on which opinions may differ—" before the word "yet"

348:4-2u "But invalid inferences are likely to be drawn from this fact, unless account is taken" replaces the original "For the fact is becoming ever more prominent to the minds of those who are not specially well-to-do; and it may be a source of some peril to the country, especially in view of the large Revenue that will be needed after the war, unless careful account be taken"

349:8-10 "no great weight on the rich; while those of them, which fall chiefly on the rich, have never been made to yield a very large amount of revenue" replaces "no appreciable weight on the rich; while those which fall chiefly on the consumption of the rich have never been made to yield any large Revenue"

350:1-2u "become a graduated tax on all personal expenditure" replaces the original "achieve the apparently impossible result of being a graduated tax on all personal expenditure"

351n1 This footnote is not in the original

352:10-13 The sentence "Ethical considerations and those of high policy alike make the preservation of the capital that is needed to sustain the strength of a country in peace and when assailed by hostile aggression." is not in the original.

Appendix: Minor Textual Variations

All entries below take the form <xy/z> where x is the *Memorials* location, y is the variant wording in *Memorials* and z is the corresponding wording in the original version. A dash for z indicates omission of the words specified in y.

95:14 calls/have called; 123:4 in employments/of employments; 123:4u should/—; 128:18 above/the previous page; 129n4 1835/1838; 142:1 may/—; 149:1 This/the; 150:15 often/generally; 154:3 this century/the nineteenth century; 155:4u repelled/moved the contempt of; 155:3u always/—; 155:1u often failed rightly to apprehend/not rightly apprehend; 156:7 felt/had felt; 156:11-10u did not commit/have not committed; 156:9-8u They did not however make/But they did not make; 156:2u He admitted/While admitting; 157.1 but /—; 157:3 did/— 157:4 some/most; 157:11 But/But for all that; 159:3 almost/just; 159:12-13 condition...is/conditions...are; 159:17 we may/I do; 159:18u The theory of mechanics/That theory; 159:16u and/—; 159:7u some/Venetian; 161:4u much confusion/many mischievous fallacies; 162:9u though they seem/which seem; 162:3u very/—; 166:14-13u history does not repeat/History never repeats; 166:2u assumption/assumptions; 170:13u the chief/chief; 175:12u others/the others; 175:1u the/my; 176:2 they may be called/I will call them; 177:4 the Statistical Society/our Society; 177:9 On this plan...figures represent/I propose then that...figures should represent; 177:11 stands/should stand; 177:12 contains/should contain; 177:13 supplements/might supplement; 177:16 are/would be; 178:7u to ship/ship; 179:11 deal/might deal; 179:3u show/show almost in an instant; 179:3u that year/1880; 180:10 organize/organises; 181:6 This is/This is, I repeat.; 184:13 ratios/ratio; 186:17 This fraction may be called/To this fraction I shall give the name; 186:18 geometric/true geometric; 186:20 draw/we draw; 186:22 This point is at/[;] we find this is at; 186:11u straight/—; 186:9u and 186n1:4 proportionate/proportional; 186:7u representing/for; 186:6u this is/—; 186:3u this/I submit then that this; 186:2u influence/influences; 187:13 It may be added/I may add briefly; 187:15 *demand curves*/what economists call the *demand curves*; 192:9 The want/Thus the want; 194:3u exhausting/exhaustive; 203:2u influence/influences; 204:11 silver and gold/gold and silver; 206n1:3 2000/200; 206n2:5u debt/debts; 211:6u a great/an; 211:4u It is an advance/—; 212:4 remuneration/wages; 212:4 "Utopia: but there"/Utopia. There; 212:7 socialist/socialistic; 213:3 notion/popular notion; 213:4 man/workman; 213:7 his/that; 213:9 and/but; 213:12 and/—; 213:16 may be held/might not be held; 213:20u If/For instance, if; 213:16u that is, if he charges/but charges; 213.15u about/—; 213:14u them to/them regularly to; 213:13u an/any; 213:12u a/the; 215:7u Changes in...may of course require/But changes in...may require; 217:19 capitalists/capital; 218:9 time contracts/term contracts; 218:3u many kinds/many thousand different kinds; 219:2 may/is bound to; 219:12 less/much less; 219:4u generally/generally then; 221:5 generously; therefore/generously, and therefore; 221:4u Of course/next; 222:17u it has been assumed that everything works smoothly/we have supposed everything to work with perfect smoothness; 222:14u may/must sometimes; 222:3u When/I venture to think that when; 222:2u and/and when; 222:1u may be/is; 223:3 if/when; 223:3 and there/when there; 225:16 his trade/the trade; 225:16u increased/have increased; 225:10u high work in/the higher work of; 267:14 in every/every; 270:5u agreement/agreements; 276n1:3 young/other young 297:14u has/have; 297:7-6u change...may alter/variation...may change; 297:2u Thus/Hence it follows that; 298:1 the forces/they; 298:3 Hence/And hence; 298:16u now recognized by everyone that an inference/now generally recognized that every inference; 298:10u in effect/—; 298:3u though/but that yet; 299:11 great/indispensible; 300:16 already made/made during the nineteenth century; 300:17 future/twentieth century; 300:14u But/for; 308:3u awarded to successful research by audiences/which successful research receives from audiences; 313n1:1-2 third edition, Book I, chap. vi, p.2/l.vi.2: the references throughout are to the third edition of 1895; 314:11u In/For; 316:11 who/—; 317:11u the/—; 323:14-10u all students accept Schmoller's dictum...strong in combination/Schmoller's dictum...strong in combination, is accepted on all sides; 333:5u activity for social ameliorations/activities for social amelioration; 334:19 narrow considerably/considerably narrow; 336:18 other/others; 336:19 so/—; 336:16u laws/Bills; 336:11u which, while/which are; 336:10u are/and yet; 336:3-2u country; that/country and that; 337:19 public servants/they themselves; 337:2u But high/High; 338:2 trade; and this seems/trade. But this would seem; 338:18 nearly all of those few

are/of those few nearly all are; 341:13-12 the ordinary members/they; 341:9-8u occasionally to make/ to make occasionally; 344:7, 10, 13 might/may; 345:7 them/-; 347:10 recognized. A/recognized: and, though a; 347:10 final: but the/final, the; 347:11 to inquire/to go behind them; to inquire; 347:2-1u call for special justification/stand in a class by themselves; 348:7 With an increase/In the one case; 348:19 heavy/heavier; 348:20 small/very small; 348:21-2 be advisable, or even possible, to/be possible to; 348:14u their benefit/their special or even exclusive benefit; 348:12-llu wealth: while enabling/wealth, while yet enabling; 348:9u Even if it be true that as much/We may not shut our eyes to the fact that though as much; 348:5u far greater/greater; 349:3 steeply/very steeply; 349:4 and/We shall see that; 349:4 large/very large; 349:5 no close/No; 350:11u but/But unfortunately; 350:10u as good/often at least as good; 350:10u some/-; 351:4 would/would then; 351:11 this way/it; 351:11 would need to be/must of course be; 351:13u unfavourable/unusually unfavourable; 351:12u and the/and so the; 351:12-11u might not be made much less...by taxation which took/would not be much less...if taxation took; 351:2u has been/was.

- [Back to Homepage](#)
-

Notes

1. Edgeworth (F.Y. 1925), *Papers Relating to Political Economy*, 3 vols., London: Macmillan.
2. Pigou A.C. (ed.) (1925), *Memorials of Alfred Marshall*, London: Macmillan.
3. Few originals of the letters reproduced in *Memorials* survive. For those that have, a comparison of the *Memorials* version with that reproduced in my *Correspondence of Alfred Marshall, Economist* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996, 3 vols.) will reveal any unacknowledged editorial change in the former. Such changes are evident in the letters reproduced in *Memorials* on pp. 398-399, 409-410, 411-415, 421-423, 443-445, and 490-491, but some discrepancies may represent Pigou's (or my) misreadings or else requests made by the providers of the originals.
4. These are "The Future of the Working Classes" (pp. 101-18), "Water as an Element of National Wealth" (pp. 134-141), and "Co-operation" (pp. 227-255). A new edition of the first is provided in Raffaelli T., Biagini E. and McWilliams Tullberg R. (eds.) (1995), *Alfred Marshall's Lectures to Women*, Aldershot: Elgar, pp. 156-175.
5. The following conventions are adopted for references to *Memorials*. Line 12 of the text on p. 135 is denoted 135:12. Lines 15 to 18 on the same page are denoted 135:15-18. Line 15 counting up from the bottom of the text on p. 135 is denoted 135:15u while lines 15 up to 13 up are denoted 135:15-13u. Footnotes have a separate line count. For example line 5 of footnote 2 on p. 135 is denoted 135n2:5. Line counts exclude headings and blank lines, but not subheadings. Equations are treated as a single line.
6. The misquotation of Jevons at 97:3u ("motions" rather than "notions") is in both versions.
7. As indicated in the [Appendix](#), the original misquotation of Mill at 123:4 ("of" rather than "in") is corrected in *Memorials*: while the date of Cournot's book given in 129n4 introduces an error not in the original.
8. The original title was "Where to House Them", the paper being part of a symposium on "The Housing of the London Poor."
9. The original has numbered paragraphs and is preceded by an analytical summary.
10. The original title was "On the Graphic Method...". Pigou's editorial footnote wrongly describes the paper as

delivered to "the International Statistical Congress, 1885". In fact it was delivered to the special Silver Jubilee meeting of the Statistical Society, soon to be the Royal Statistical Society.

11. The allusion is to *Fossick's Fifty Years' History of the Iron Trade*. Diagram... Compiled and Designed by Richard Rous Mabson (London: E. and F.N. Spon, 1881). This reproduction of data compiled by William G. Fossick is described in the *Journal of the [Royal] Statistical Society*, vol. 43, June 1880, pp. 380-381.

12. Originally this formed most of an untitled preface dated 28th June 1887 that Marshall provided for LLFR Price, *Industrial Peace* (London: Macmillan, 1887), a report on work supported by the Toynbee Trust. The portion reproduced in *Memorials* was preceded in the original by a description of the Trust and an appreciation of Arnold Toynbee, but is otherwise complete aside from the variations noted in the text. The *Memorials* version added subheads, but deleted all footnotes.

13. An extract from "Distribution and Exchange", *Economic Journal*, Vol.8, March 1898, pp. 37-59 covering Section I and most of Section II. At 316:18 both versions read "on" but "or" seems required for sense.

14. This and the next item do not reproduce the original texts completely. These are to be found in vol.2 of *The Correspondence of Alfred Marshall*, *Economist* at pp. 440-442 and 309-311, respectively.

15. The original title is prefixed "The" and subsections in the original are titled but not numbered.

16. An extract from Marshall's essay *National Taxation After the War*, in W.H. Dawson (ed.) (1917), *After-War Problems*, London: George Allen and Unwin, pp. 313-45. The extract covers sections 2, 3 and a part of 4 in Part I of the essay.